

SUPREME COURT OF INDIA

The Supreme Court Collegium recommended the names of the Judicial Officers for appointment as Judges in the High Court of Gujarat in the following terms:

The Collegium of the High Court of Gujarat comprising of the then Chief Justice and two senior-most Judges unanimously made the recommendation on 26 September 2022. The Chief Minister and the Governor of the State of Gujarat have concurred with the recommendation.

In order to ascertain the fitness and suitability of the Judicial Officers for elevation to the High Court, in terms of the Memorandum of Procedure, the Judges of the Supreme Court conversant with the affairs of the High Court of Gujarat were consulted.

For the purpose of assessing the merit and suitability of the candidates for elevation to the High Court, we have scrutinized and evaluated the material placed on record, including the inputs furnished by the Intelligence Bureau. We have also perused the observations made by the Department of Justice in the file.

1. Ms Susan Valentine Pinto

The Collegium has considered (i) the report of the Judgment Committee of the High Court which has assessed the judgments of the candidate under consideration; (ii) the report of the Intelligence Bureau; and (iii) the opinion of the consultee-judges with regard to suitability of Ms. Pinto. She is from the Higher Judicial Service of the State of

Gujarat. She is an experienced Judicial Officer. Nothing adverse to her integrity has been placed on record. In view of the above, the Collegium is of the considered opinion that Ms Susan Valentine Pinto is fit and suitable for being appointed as a Judge of the High Court of Gujarat.

2. Shri Hasmukhbhai Dalsukhbhai Suthar

The Collegium has considered (i) the report of the Judgment Committee in the High Court which has assessed the judgments of the candidate under consideration; (ii) the report of the Intelligence Bureau; and (iii) the opinion of the consultee-judges with regard to suitability of Shri Suthar. He is a member of the Higher Judicial Service of the State of Gujarat. He is an experienced Judicial Officer. Nothing adverse to his integrity has been placed on record. In view of the above, the Collegium is of the considered opinion that Shri Hasmukhbhai Dalsukhbhai Suthar is fit and suitable for being appointed as a Judge of the High Court of Gujarat.

3. Shri Jitendra Champaklal Doshi

The Collegium has considered (i) the report of the Judgment Committee in the High Court which has assessed the judgments of the candidate under consideration; (ii) the report of the Intelligence Bureau; and (iii) the opinion of the consultee-judges with regard to suitability of Shri Doshi. He is a member of the Higher Judicial Service of the State of Gujarat. He is an experienced Judicial Officer. Nothing adverse to his integrity has been placed on record. In view of the above, the Collegium is of the considered opinion that Shri Jitendra Champaklal Doshi is fit and suitable for being appointed as a Judge of the High Court of Gujarat.

4. Shri Mangesh Rameshchandra Mengdey

The Collegium has considered (i) the report of the Judgment Committee in the High Court which has assessed the judgments of the candidate under consideration; (ii) the report of the Intelligence Bureau; and (iii) the opinion of the consultee-judges with regard to suitability of Shri Mengdey. He is a member of the Higher Judicial Service of the State of Gujarat. He is an experienced Judicial Officer. Nothing adverse to his integrity has been placed on record. In view of the above, the Collegium is of the considered opinion that Shri Mangesh Rameshchandra Mengdey is suitable for being appointed as a Judge of the High Court of Gujarat.

5. Shri Divyeshkumar Amrutlal Joshi

The Collegium has considered (i) the report of the Judgment Committee in the High Court which has assessed the judgments of the candidate under consideration; (ii) the report of the Intelligence Bureau; and (iii) the opinion of the consultee-judges with regard to suitability of Shri Joshi. He is a member of the Higher Judicial Service of the State of Gujarat. He is an experienced Judicial Officer. Nothing adverse to his integrity has been placed on record. In view of the above, the Collegium is of the considered opinion that Shri Divyeshkumar Amrutlal Joshi is suitable for being appointed as a Judge of the High Court of Gujarat.

While considering the above proposal, the Collegium has also taken note of the fact that the above proposal involves non-recommendation of two senior Judicial Officers. In this regard, we find that the High Court Collegium, has duly recorded reasons for not recommending the names of those Judicial Officers. We are in

agreement with the justification given by the High Court Collegium in its Minutes for not recommending the senior Judicial Officers.

In view of the above, the Collegium resolves to recommend that (1) Ms. Susan Valentine Pinto, S/Shri (2) Hasmukhbhai Dalsukhbhai Suthar, (3) Jitendra Champaklal Doshi, (4) Mangesh Rameshchandra Mengdey, and (5) Divyeshkumar Amrutlal Joshi, Judicial Officers, be appointed as Judges of the High Court of Gujarat. Their inter se seniority be fixed as per the existing practice.

(Dhananjaya Y Chandrachud), CJI

(Sanjay Kishan Kaul), J

(K.M. Joseph), J

02 March 2023

