

SUPREME COURT OF INDIA

This file relates to the proposal for appointment of following six Additional Judges of the Bombay High Court, as Permanent Judges of that High Court:

1. Mr. Justice Prakash Deu Naik,
2. Mr. Justice Makarand Subhash Karnik,
3. Smt. Justice Swapna Sanjiv Joshi,
4. Mr. Justice Kishor Kalesh Sonawane,
5. Mr. Justice Sangitrao Shamrao Patil, and
6. Ms. Justice Nutan Dattaram Sardessai.

The above recommendation unanimously made by the Collegium of the Bombay High Court vide Minutes dated 21st September, 2017 has the concurrence of the Chief Ministers for the States of Maharashtra & Goa and the Governor for the State of Maharashtra.

In order to ascertain suitability of the above-named recommendees for being appointed as Permanent Judges, we have consulted our colleagues who are conversant with the affairs of the Bombay High Court. Copies of letters of their opinion received in this regard are placed below.

The Committee constituted in terms of the Resolution dated 26th October, 2017 of the Supreme Court Collegium to assess the Judgments of the above-named recommendees, has submitted its report. A copy of the same is placed below.

We have taken note of certain complaints making allegations against some of the above-named recommendees. We do not see any merit in the aforesaid complaints as the allegations made therein are false, frivolous or without any substance. In our considered view, the said complaints deserve to be ignored, particularly, in the light of positive material on record.

Taking into consideration the material on record, including the recommendation of the High Court Collegium, views of our consultee-colleagues and the report of the Judgment Evaluation Committee, the Collegium finds all the above-named Additional Judges suitable for being appointed as Permanent Judges.

In view of the above, the Collegium resolves to recommend that Mr. Justices (1) Prakash Deu Naik, (2) Makarand Subhash Karnik, (3) Smt. Swapna Sanjiv Joshi, (4) Kishor Kalesh Sonawane, (5) Sangitrao Shamrao Patil, and (6) Ms. Nutan Dattaram Sardessai, Additional Judges be appointed as Permanent Judges of the Bombay High Court.

(Dipak Misra), C.J.I.

(J. Chelameswar), J.

(Ranjan Gogoi), J.

February 22, 2018.

