



***5th March, 1933 – 11th September, 2021***

*Full Court Reference in the memory of*

***Late Shri P. N. Nag***

***Senior Advocate***

*held on Thursday, the 3rd March 2022*

*at 3.00 p.m. in the Auditorium at 3rd Floor, 'C' Block,  
Additional Building Complex, Supreme Court of India*



## ***INDEX***

<b><i>Sl. No.</i></b>	<b><i>Description</i></b>	<b><i>Page Nos.</i></b>
1.	<i>Letter from the Registrar, Supreme Court of India</i>	1
2.	<i>List of Business at 3:00 P.M. for 3rd March 2022 held in the Auditorium at 3rd Floor, 'C' Block, Additional Building Complex, Supreme Court of India</i>	2
3.	<i>Coram of Hon'ble Judges at the Full Court Reference</i>	3
4.	<i>Reference made by Ld. Attorney General for India</i>	4 - 15
5.	<i>Reference made by the President, Supreme Court Bar Association (SCBA)</i>	16 - 24
6.	<i>Reference made by Hon'ble the Chief Justice of India</i>	25 - 33
7.	<i>List of Attendees at the Full Court Reference</i>	34
8.	<i>Family members of Late Shri P. N. Nag, Senior Advocate</i>	35





## *Letter from the Registrar, Supreme Court of India*

*Avani Pal Singh*  
*Registrar*  
*Supreme Court of India*



F.No.99/Ref/2021/SCA(Genl)  
Dated the 04<sup>th</sup> March, 2022

Shri Anil Nag,  
A-64, Sector-39,  
Noida-201303,  
Uttar Pradesh.

Sir,

There was a Full Court Reference in the Auditorium of the Additional Building Complex, Supreme Court of India on 03<sup>rd</sup> March, 2022 in the memory of late Shri P.N. Nag, Senior Advocate. Rich tributes were paid to Shri Nag by Shri K.K. Venugopal, Learned Attorney General for India, Shri Vikas Singh, President, Supreme Court Bar Association and Hon'ble Shri N.V. Ramana, Chief Justice of India. After the references were read, two minutes' silence was observed. I have the honour of forwarding a booklet containing memorial speeches delivered at the Full Court Reference, as aforesaid.

Kindly permit me to convey the heart-felt condolences of the Officers and members of the staff of the Supreme Court Registry to you and other members of the family.

Yours sincerely,

Registrar(AG)

Encls: As above

***List of Business for 3rd March, 2022 in respect of  
Full Court Reference***



**SUPREME COURT OF INDIA**

**LIST OF BUSINESS FOR THURSDAY THE 03RD MARCH, 2022**

**IN THE AUDITORIUM AT 3RD FLOOR, 'C' BLOCK, ADDITIONAL  
BUILDING COMPLEX, SUPREME COURT OF INDIA**

**AT 03.00 P.M.**

**FULL COURT REFERENCE IN THE MEMORY OF  
LATE SHRI VINOD KUMAR SINGH,  
LATE SHRI ARUN B. SAHARYA,  
LATE SHRI V.N. GANPULE,  
LATE SHRI S.K. DHOLAKIA AND  
LATE SHRI P.N. NAG,  
SENIOR ADVOCATES.**

## ***Coram of Hon'ble Judges at the Full Court Reference***

- ❖ *Hon'ble Shri N. V. Ramana, Chief Justice of India*
- ❖ *Hon'ble Mr. Justice Uday Umesh Lalit*
- ❖ *Hon'ble Mr. Justice A.M. Khanwilkar*
- ❖ *Hon'ble Dr. Justice D.Y. Chandrachud*
- ❖ *Hon'ble Mr. Justice L. Nageswara Rao*
- ❖ *Hon'ble Mr. Justice Sanjay Kishan Kaul*
- ❖ *Hon'ble Mr. Justice S. Abdul Nazeer*
- ❖ *Hon'ble Ms. Justice Indira Banerjee*
- ❖ *Hon'ble Mr. Justice Ajay Rastogi*
- ❖ *Hon'ble Mr. Justice Sanjiv Khanna*
- ❖ *Hon'ble Mr. Justice Surya Kant*
- ❖ *Hon'ble Mr. Justice Aniruddha Bose*
- ❖ *Hon'ble Mr. Justice A.S. Bopanna*
- ❖ *Hon'ble Mr. Justice Krishna Murari*
- ❖ *Hon'ble Mr. Justice S. Ravindra Bhat*
- ❖ *Hon'ble Mr. Justice Abhay S. Oka*
- ❖ *Hon'ble Mr. Justice Vikram Nath*
- ❖ *Hon'ble Mr. Justice J.K. Maheshwari*
- ❖ *Hon'ble Mrs. Justice B.V. Nagarathna*
- ❖ *Hon'ble Mr. Justice C.T. Ravikumar*
- ❖ *Hon'ble Mr. Justice M.M. Sundresh*
- ❖ *Hon'ble Ms. Justice Bela M. Trivedi*
- ❖ *Hon'ble Mr. Justice Pamidighantam Sri Narasimha*

xxxxx

*Reference made on 3rd March, 2022*

*by*

***Attorney General For India***

***Shri K. K. Venugopal***

*in the memory of*

***Late Shri Vinod Kumar Singh,***

***Late Shri Arun B. Saharya,***

***Late Shri V. N. Ganpule,***

***Late Shri S. K. Dholakia and***

***Late Shri P. N. Nag,***

***Senior Advocates***

*Hon'ble the Chief Justice of India, Justice N.V. Ramana, Hon'ble Judges of the Supreme Court, the Solicitor General of India, Sh. Tushar Mehta, the Additional Solicitors General, President of the Supreme Court Bar Association, Sh. Vikas Singh and office bearers of the SCBA, President of the Supreme Court Advocates on Record Association, Sh. Shivaji Jadhav and other office bearers of the SCAORA, the family members of Sh. P.N. Nag, Sh. Vinod Kumar Singh, Sh. Arun B. Saharya, Sh. V.N. Ganpule and Sh. S.K. Dholakia and my colleagues at the Bar:*

*We are gathered here today on this highly sombre occasion to pay our respects to five respected members of the legal profession, Sh. Vinod Kumar Singh, Sh. Arun B. Saharya, Sh. V.N. Ganpule, Sh. S.K. Dholakia and Sh. P.N. Nag.*

***Shri Vinod Kumar Singh***

*Shri Vinod Kumar Singh was born on 1st March 1947. After completing his schooling, the field of science and scientific learning appears to have fascinated him, leading him to obtain a B.Sc. degree from the University of Allahabad. Life, however, had a different plan. It steered him towards a career in the law, and after his B.Sc. degree he went on to earn his LLB degree, also from the University of Allahabad.*

*He enrolled with the Uttar Pradesh Bar Council in March of 1975, and enthusiastically began legal practice. He began his career at the District Court in Gonda in Uttar Pradesh, where he learned the ropes. With the passage of time, he developed a successful law practice of his own. His aptitude and performance as a lawyer did not go unnoticed, and he was soon appointed as the Additional Government Counsel/Public Prosecutor. He discharged his duties with diligence and industry.*

*Despite building up a successful practice in the District Court, he felt the urge to paint on a wider canvas. From the year 1982, he began to practice before the Lucknow Bench of the Allahabad High Court. His work in the High Court spanned multiple fields of law. He handled both civil and criminal cases, as well as writ petitions. Through meticulousness and hard work, he was able to establish himself in the High Court as well.*

*In the year 1995, he came to be appointed as the Standing Counsel for State of Uttar Pradesh in the High Court. He held this position till the year 2000. During these years, he represented the interests of the State Government and its entities with skill and ability. Apart from the State Government, he built up a sizeable clientele which included corporations as well as Co-operative Banks.*

*Immediately following the events of December 1992, involving the Babri Masjid in Ayodhya, the Government of India had set up a Commission of Enquiry, comprising of Justice M.S. Liberhan, a former Chief Justice of the Andhra Pradesh High Court. The Commission was tasked with conducting a comprehensive enquiry into the matter. The proceedings before this Commission lasted more than 15 years, and the report of the commission was tabled in Parliament in November, 2009. The matter was obviously a sensitive one, and Shri Vinod Kumar Singh had the privilege of representing the State of Uttar Pradesh before this Commission in the year 2003.*

*In the year 2004, Shri Singh was appointed as the Additional Advocate General for the State of Uttar Pradesh before the High Court at Lucknow. He held this position till May, 2007. It was during this period that, recognizing his standing and capability as an advocate, he was designated as a Senior Advocate by the High Court in the year 2006.*

*In the same year, disputes arose in relation to the elections to the Oudh Bar Association. A Writ Petition was filed before the High Court in relation to this dispute,*



*and the High Court constituted a committee of five Senior Advocates to help resolve the issues. Shri Vinod Kumar Singh was one among these five Senior Advocates. The recommendations made by this committee included a new set of bye-laws, which were accepted by the Bar Association and registered. These bye-laws continue to govern the bar association till date.*

*Shri Singh was not one to remain aloof from the issues affecting the legal fraternity, and was an active participant in the affairs of the Bar. He was a life-time member of the Oudh Bar Association, and on one occasion he was elected to serve as its Vice-President. He was also a member of the Supreme Court Bar Association, apart from being a life-time member of the Indian Law Institute and the Bar Association of India.*

*Shri Singh was obviously an inspiration to his children, both of whom have chosen to follow his footsteps and pursue their calling in the legal profession. His son Shri Ashutosh Singh, practices before the High Court at Lucknow, and, very much like his father, is a standing counsel for the State of Uttar Pradesh. His daughter Ms. Rashmi Singh is an Advocate on Record, with an active practice in the Supreme Court.*

*Unfortunately, the scourge of Covid-19 snatched Shri Vinod Kumar Singh from our midst, and he succumbed to the disease on 5th May, 2021. Apart from his two children, he is survived by his wife Smt. Saroj Singh. I offer them, and all other members of his family, my heartfelt condolences.*

### ***Sh. Arun B. Saharya***

*The task that falls upon those of us who mourn the departed is a painful one. More so, when the person is a friend. I had known Sh. Saharya for many years, for he was a few years my junior in the practice, and we would often chat in the corridors of the Supreme Court as we waited for our respective matters to be taken up. Quiet and very proper, Sh. Saharya's most notable quality was his innate sense of propriety. Here was a man, who whether as a counsel or a judge was always known to do the right thing, to never compromise his principles and a person whom virtually everyone had a positive word for. If any of us can claim that distinction at the end of our lives, it would indeed be a life well lived.*

*Sh. Saharya was born on 15.09.1940 at Delhi, the son of the legal luminary Sh. Sardar Bahadur Saharya and did his schooling from Cambridge School, Delhi, graduating from the prestigious St. Stevens College, Delhi. He followed in his late father's footsteps and joined the legal profession obtaining his LL.B. from the Delhi University and enrolled as an advocate on the rolls of the Mysore State Bar Council in October 1963 and later the Delhi Bar Council in 1965. He commenced his practice in the chambers of Retired Hon'ble Justice Prakash Narian, Chief Justice Delhi High Court, who was a senior advocate at that time. Sh. Saharya built up an extremely respectable practice over the years, being a Central Government Standing Counsel, and was also oft sought after by various Public Sector Undertakings, statutory bodies and private litigants as well. On 19.11.1984, he was designated Senior Advocate by the Delhi High Court and I am sure there would have been no limit to the success he would have achieved as a counsel, had he chosen to remain at the Bar.*

*Many paeans are often sung of those who start from humble beginnings to achieve great heights, but let us also recognize the virtue of those who are born well but retain their sense of fairness and humility. Sh. Saharya, was a person who could have lived a privileged existence, divorced from the realities of those less fortunate than himself, yet he chose to give up an extremely lucrative practice, and accept judgeship of the Delhi High Court, being appointed permanent judge on 24.04.1986. He was thereafter appointed as Chief Justice of Punjab and Haryana High Court on 07.11.1997 retiring after a long tenure of nearly five years on 14.09.2002.*

*A testament to Sh. Saharya's humility is the fact that he would stand up to greet all those who came to meet him in his chamber. One of his former juniors fondly recalled his first interaction with Sh. Saharya upon joining his chamber. Sh. Saharya had instructed him to draft a writ petition, which was something the young lawyer knew nothing about. Instead of being impatient with him however, Sh. Saharya painstakingly explained how to go about preparing the case - first to arrange the documents chronologically, understand the facts of the case as if it were a story, and finally how to prepare the propositions for argument and drafting. I am sure that everyone would agree with me when I say that mentorship of this nature is a rare thing, and the fact that his junior was able to recollect this incident so many decades later is a testament to the role that Sh. Saharya played in the formative years of a young lawyer's career.*

*Sh. Saharya's fondness for his juniors, who referred to him respectfully as “Bhai Saheb”, however in no way interfered with his sense of propriety. When he was elevated to the Bench, it was understood that under no circumstances could any one of his juniors appear before him, and when one junior did so, only for the purpose of recusing himself, he earned a stiff rebuke in Court.*

*Sh. Saharya's perfectionism, earned him the reputation of being a judge who could never be hurried and would spare nothing to ensure that he was arriving at the correct conclusion in a matter. A lawyer who had appeared before him when he was the Chief Justice of the Punjab and Haryana High Court recollects an incident where he was most pleasantly surprised to find Sh. Saharya conversing in Punjabi with a litigant, who was not fluent in English, despite the fact that Sh. Saharya was from a different State.*

*Justice Saharya who was known for his utmost probity in public life handled many a difficult decision while serving as Chief Justice of the Punjab and Haryana High Court, yet he never shied away from doing the correct thing, even when faced with tremendous opposition. While serving as Chief Justice, he delivered several important judgments, and presided over a Five Judge Bench of the High Court in *Kashmir Singh v. Union of India* (2008) 7 SCC 259 which examined the procedure for removal of members of the Sikh Gurudwara Judicial Commission.*

*Post retirement, Sh. Saharya returned to his family in Delhi, and also restarted practice at the Supreme Court of India. He was also frequently appointed arbitrator where he was known for ensuring as swift a disposal of proceedings as possible. Sh. Saharya genuinely cared for the legal profession, and in his retired life, he frequently delivered lectures and training sessions at the judicial academy for judges in Delhi and Chandigarh.*

*My last interaction with Sh. Saharya was in April of last year. He had written to me asking to discuss an issue which was troubling him. Since we were in the midst of the Covid-19 pandemic, a Video Conference was chosen as the best possible method of interacting. As soon as the meeting started, it became clear that what was troubling Sh. Saharya was the fact that the Courts were facing unprecedented interruptions due to the pandemic. Sh. Saharya was keen that some way forward should be thought of so that the Courts, the lawyers and most importantly the litigant public should not suffer for want of access to justice.*



*Sh. Saharya passed away on 20 May 2021 and was predeceased by his wife Smt. Prabha Saharya on 15.03.2020. The couple was issueless. However, he was extremely fond of his nephews Viresh and Vivek, both of whom are respected lawyers in their own right. I consider his death a personal loss, and offer my condolences to his nephews Vivek and Viresh, his brother Vishnu B. Saharya and the rest of his family. May the memories of the departed soul give them solace.*

### ***Shri Vasant N. Ganpule***

*Shri Vasant N. Ganpule was born on 28th July, 1936 in pre-independent India. His father, Late Mr. Narayan M. Ganpule was an advocate with a successful practice at Barshi in Solapur District in Maharashtra. Destined to follow in his father's footsteps, Ganpule joined ILS Law College, Pune to pursue law. Within three years, armed with an LL.B. degree, he registered with the Bar Council of Maharashtra in August 1961 and started practicing in the Bombay High Court.*

*His foray into litigation was under the wings of Shri K.J. Abhyankar, who had built a formidable practice on the appellate side in the Bombay High Court. Ganpule was extremely hardworking and had a thirst for success. He quickly learnt the ropes and started to accept briefs independently within a few years.*

*The year 1970 proved to be a turning point in his professional career. His decision to shift his practice to the Supreme Court of India after only 9 years of practice as an advocate acted as a catalyst to his success. At that time, there was no one from the appellate side in Bombay practicing in the Supreme Court. While there were Advocates-on-Record from Maharashtra, they were either from Nagpur or Aurangabad, or like J.B. Dadachandji were practicing on the original side. Therefore a group of advocates from Bombay had encouraged Ganpule to shift to Delhi and even sponsored his move to Delhi to set up practice here. They would all approach Vasant Ganpule when their matters were brought in appeal to the Supreme Court.*

*On 19.09.1974, Ganpule became an Advocate-on-Record. As an AoR, he argued his cases himself, preferring to brief senior advocates only on rare occasions. Ganpule had a thriving practice as an AoR – at the peak of his practice, his filings reached about 300 to 400 cases a year! Despite his heavy workload he was actively associated with the*

*Supreme Court Legal Aid Service Committee and worked for its betterment and development.*

*He was one of the founder Members of the Supreme Court Advocate-on-Record Association which was formed in the year 1985 and he was elected as Vice President of the Association. He was designated as Senior Advocate by the Supreme Court of India on 01.01.1991 and appeared in several cases involving significant issues of law. In 2011, having completed 50 years of practice, he settled down in Pune but would continue to come to the Supreme Court to attend select matters.*

*His chambers was home to about 30 advocates whom he had taken on as his juniors. His legacy continues in the success of his juniors as well as in the success of those he mentored along the way. I am told that Justice A.M. Khanwilkar, when he came over to Delhi from Bombay, was Shri Ganpule's junior for a brief period of two years. Justice Madan Lokur, former judge of the Supreme Court, had also worked with him and fondly refers to Shri Ganpule as his mentor. His longest association was with Justice Satish Kumar Agnihotri, retired Chief Justice of the High Court of Sikkim, who worked with Shri Ganpule for about 20 years. There are today several advocates who warmly remember Vasant Ganpule as their mentor and guide in the profession and who speak warmly of their indebtedness to him.*

*No account of Vasant Ganpule's life would be complete without admiring his social service work. He was closely associated with the Lanjha Sangameshwar Mitra Mandal Society which adopted schools in remote villages and funded the hostels or orphanages that were attached and also provided books, stationary and clothes. Each summer vacation, he personally visited these schools and institutes in the remote villages of the Konkan region, and physically helped implement the work on ground. Ganpule is also responsible for the establishment of the first cancer hospital in his hometown in Barshi, Solapur.*

*Those who knew him would remember that he always carried sweets in his pocket for little children. I am told that during the lockdown, he felicitated the kids in his society in Pune for obeying their parents and for following the lockdown rules. Throughout his lifetime, Ganpule took it upon himself to take care of the education of so many under-privileged kids, many of whom are today successful in their own respective fields.*

*Vasant Ganpule's warmth touched the lives of every single individual whom he met. He was a family man. As the eldest son, he took on the responsibility of educating all of his seven siblings and even took care of their marriages. He was a great friend to all. An enthusiastic conversationalist, one often ended up engaging in fiery debates with him.*

*His passing away on account of a stroke just a few months after the death of his wife, who had succumbed to Covid, came as a shock. I offer my deepest condolences to his children Sangeeta, Yogini and Sameer, and wish them strength to bear the loss of their father, a fine human being and a man of stature who lifted the lives of many. He will be remembered for long by the members of the Bar.*

### ***Late Shri S. K. Dholakia***

*Late Shri S.K. Dholakia, affectionately known as Shishirbhai, was born on 23rd May 1938 to Kanaiyalal and Saroj Dholakia, in Gujarat. He started his education in a Gujarati medium school, with little knowledge or instruction in the English language in his early years. Shri Dholakia later joined St. Xavier's, Mumbai, which is where he not just mastered the language, through sheer effort, but went on to become an orator par excellence in English.*

*Shri Dholakia then went on to join the Law College in Pune, and graduated at the top of his class. Like so many of us in those years, he too did not immediately take to the law, and joined Air India for a brief period. He, however, soon realised that the legal profession was where he belonged. Shri Dholakia joined the Bar in 1966 and started practicing in Delhi.*

*Shri Dholakia quickly made a place for himself at the Bar. He specialized in commercial laws, taxation, and arbitration laws, and represented the leaders of the Indian business community in the Supreme Court of India and the Delhi High Court for over 50 years. Due to his stature at the Bar and his extensive practice in arbitration and company law cases, Shri Dholakia was designated as a Senior Advocate by the Delhi High Court in 1983. His hallmark was his calm and persuasive presentation of the case, without raising his voice and without getting flustered, however loud and abrasive his opponent may be, and this I have seen myself. His ever-smiling demeanor successfully defused even the most heated of situations.*



*Shri Dholakia's designation as a Senior Advocate was only a small stepping stone in a long and exemplary life, which is marked by excellence achieved in all areas of the law wherever he ventured. Shri Dholakia was an expert in International Commercial Arbitration, and was the Vice-President of the Asia Pacific Regional Arbitration Group based in Seoul, a Director on the Board of London Court of International Arbitration[LCIA], India, and a member of the ICC Court of International Arbitration. He was also on the Executive Committee of the International Council of Alternate Dispute Resolution, New Delhi as well as the Construction International Arbitration Council. He also represented India on the Arbitration Committee of the International Law Association, London.*

*His expertise in arbitration was used by the Government of India as well, and Shri Dholakia served on the committee set up by the Law Commission of India to consider amendments to the Arbitration and Conciliation Act of 1996 in 2015, and to approve amendments to the existing Indian Bilateral Investment Treaties[BITs]. The Law Reports record his appearance and his erudite submissions in several cases which led to the development of commercial law, including Bharat Aluminium Co. v. Kaiser Aluminium Technical Services Inc., (2012) 9 SCC 552 and Northern Railway Admn. v. Patel Engg. Co. Ltd., (2008) 10 SCC 240 dealing with the Arbitration and Conciliation Act, 1996, and Special Reference No. 1 of 2001, In re, (2004) 4 SCC 489, dealing with the validity of the Gujarat Gas (Regulation of Transmission, Supply and Distribution) Act, 2001.*

*Shri Dholakia's reputation for integrity, and of course his knowledge of the law, led to his being offered judgeship twice, once in 1983 by the Gujarat High Court and later in 1985 by the Delhi High Court. Shri Dholakia reportedly declined both the offers as he felt that he could serve the profession for much longer than the retirement age of 62 years.*

*Shri Dholakia dedicated his life to the law and to learning and writing about it. He consistently wrote for the Economic Times from the 1980s, and wrote a book titled “The Rights of Minority Shareholders.” He wrote multiple academic articles on taxation and arbitration, which were published in national and international journals of repute, and had a constant presence in the Supreme Court Library. He was a teacher to his many juniors over the years, many of whom, such as Shri Raju Ramachandran who practices in this Court, have attained eminence as lawyers in their own right. His dedication to the*

*cause of education also extended outside the law- he was the Chairman of the Gujarat Education Society, the governing body of the Sardar Patel Vidyalaya, one of the top schools in Delhi. He served on the Board of the Society for several years.*

*Shri Dholakia was a man of culture. Quite outside the law, he was passionate about reading books on history, philosophy, literature, and mathematics. He loved the challenge of learning a new subject, and frequented libraries and bookstores with great regularity. He was an active member, and indeed a pillar, of the Gujarati community in Delhi, and was actively involved in their cultural activities.*

*Shri Dholakia found a partner for life in Late Smt. Yamini Dholakia, who was a news reader on the All India Radio for many years. They are survived by their three children, two daughters and one son, Shri Ashish Dholakia, who is also a Senior Advocate practicing in Delhi. We deeply mourn his loss and extend our deepest condolences to his family.*

### ***Sh. P. N. Nag***

*Sh. P.N. Nag's beginnings were humble, yet, his determination to prevail over his circumstances was evident from an early age as he used to walk to his college, which was located at a distance of about 22 kilometres from the village where he resided in order to save the bus fare. Sh. P.N. Nag's life is one of perseverance over circumstance and of determination in the face of adversity. Sh. P.N. Nag was born on 05th March 1933 in Shahpur which is a small and idyllic town in the beautiful district of Kangra, Himachal Pradesh. He passed his matriculation examination from Govt. High School, Shahpur and completed his graduation from the Govt. Degree College, Dharamshala.*

*He was undeterred by his humble background and soon started preparing for the highly competitive civil services examination ultimately passing the written examination with flying colours. Though he did not qualify in the interview, he did not lose heart and in the same year successfully appeared in the examination for the post of Direct Recruit Assistant in the Government of India.*

*In those days a Government job was prestigious and offered security and respectability. Yet it failed to satisfy Sh. P.N. Nag's thirst for knowledge. After working for*

*some years, he decided to enrol himself in the evening law classes held at Delhi University. After obtaining his law degree, he quit his government job and started his legal practice in the year 1965. One can only imagine how tiring it must have been to balance both a full time job during the day and pursue one's studies in the evening but Sh. P.N. Nag was resolute in his objective. I am told that he would ride his bicycle to the University from Gole Market, where he used to reside.*

*Sh. P.N. Nag started his legal practice in the District Court, Dharamshala, but this was only for a brief period of a year or so, after which he shifted his practice to the High Court of Shimla. Between 1966 and 1971, the Delhi High Court exercised jurisdiction over the Union Territory of Himachal Pradesh and Sh. P.N. Nag got the opportunity to appear before judicial stalwarts like Justice H.R. Khanna, Justice Hardyal Hardy and Justice Tatachari, among others.*

*At the High Court, Sh. P.N. Nag established himself as a leading lawyer in the field of constitutional law and election law. He was respected and extremely popular with his colleagues, and was elected as the Vice-President of the Himachal Pradesh High Court Bar Association. One of the major highlights of Sh. Nag's legal career came when he was appointed as Advocate General for the State of Himachal Pradesh on 05th March 1983. He served as Advocate General for five and a half years till he was appointed as a permanent judge of the High Court of Delhi on 12th October 1988. He was later appointed as Judge of the Allahabad High Court of Judicature on 28th April 1994 and retired on 05th March 1995.*

*During his tenure on the Bench, Sh. Nag was known to be a fearless judge who certainly did not shy away from taking up difficult assignments. He presided over the tribunal constituted to examine the Government's decision to ban both the dreaded LTTE as well as the Islamic Sevak Sangh under the Unlawful Activities Prevention Act.*

*Post retirement, Sh. P.N. Nag was designated Senior Advocate by the Supreme Court of India and resumed his practice at the Supreme Court. Yet immediately thereafter, he was appointed Chairman of the Himachal Pradesh State Consumer Forum. Yet, despite the heights to which he had risen, he never forgot his roots. Perhaps because of the hardships that he faced in his younger days, Sh. P.N. Nag was involved in various*

*charitable endeavours. Prior to his death, he had established a trust in his father's name to help the poor and needy.*

*Sh. Nag was a man of varied interests and hobbies and loved listening to old Hindi songs of Talat Mehmood and Mohammad Rafi. He had been a student of political science during his college days, and never lost his interest in the subject throughout his career. I am told that he had closely studied the making and subsequent disintegration of the Soviet Union, China's rise under Mao Tse Tung and the shaping of India's democracy, and was keenly aware of the latest developments in international politics.*

*He was not a religious man and would never visit temples, yet he was extremely spiritual and a strict vegetarian avoiding even onions in his diet. His family members recall that his dietary preferences, caused him a little trouble whenever he went out to have a meal.*

*Sh. P.N. Nag was known to be a straightforward lawyer and a down to earth judge, unaffected by the trappings of his prestigious office. He passed away on 11.09.2021 and was predeceased by his wife Smt. Kanta by three years. They are survived by three sons Sh. Anil Nag, who is a successful Advocate-on-Record of this Hon'ble court, Sh. Anuj Nag, who practices at the Shimla High Court and Sh. Abilash Nag. I offer my deepest condolences to the bereaved family members.*

xxxxx



*Reference made on 3rd March, 2022*

*by*

***Shri Vikas Singh (Sr.)***

***President, SCBA***

*in the memory of*

***Late Shri Vinod Kumar Singh,***

***Late Shri Arun B. Saharya,***

***Late Shri V. N. Ganpule,***

***Late Shri S. K. Dholakia and***

***Late Shri P. N. Nag,***

***Senior Advocates***

*Hon'ble the Chief Justice of India, Hon'ble Judges of this Court, Ld. Attorney General for India, Law Officers, Members of the families of Late Shri Vinod Kumar Singh, Late Shri Arun B. Saharya, Late Shri V.N. Ganpule, Late Shri S.K. Dholakia & Late Shri P.N. Nag, Members of Executive Committee of SCBA, Shivaji Jadhav, President SCAORA, Members of Executive Committee of SCAORA, Members of the Bar, ladies and gentlemen.*

*Death is inevitable. The goal is not to live forever, but to create something that lives forever. I consider it a sad, but a proud privilege, that I am allowed to pay my tribute to five great gentlemen and legal stalwarts.*

***Mr. Vinod Kumar Singh***

***(March 1, 1947 - May 5, 2021)***

*Mr. Vinod Kumar Singh was born on March 1, 1947. He completed his graduation in B.Sc. from University of Allahabad and further pursued his LLB in 1975. Subsequent to his enrollment in the U.P. Bar Council on March 19, 1975 he began to practice in the District Courts at Gonda (U.P.). In the year 1982, he shifted his practice to the Allahabad High Court and joined the chambers of Late Sri B.K. Singh.*



*His love for law was not only restricted to the practice of law but he was equally interested in reading and few of his favourite authors were Lord Denning, Justice V.R. Krishna Iyer and Edmund Heward.*

*Mr. Singh was the Standing Counsel of the State of U.P. and represented the State before the Allahabad High Court, Lucknow Bench from 1995 to 2000. He also appeared for a number of State Corporations before the High Court of Allahabad. He was the representative of the State of U.P. in the Liberhan Ayodhya Commission appointed to probe the Babri Masjid demolition. In 2004, he was appointed as the Assistant Advocate General for the State of Uttar Pradesh before the High Court of Allahabad and was designated as a Senior Advocate in 2006. In 2006, he was also a part of the Committee of Lawyers conferred with the responsibility of resolving the issue that arose over the elections of the Oudh Bar Association.*

*He moved his practice to the Supreme Court in 2007 and represented a wide range of clients in both civil and criminal matters and within a short span of time made his presence felt in the Supreme Court Bar.*

*Mr. Singh was a very friendly human being and always supported his junior colleagues. Once in court, one of the junior members of the Bar was getting nervous while arguing a matter. Mr. Singh intervened and helped the junior lawyer, to which the Judge replied that since Mr. Singh has himself come to the rescue of the junior, he should be granted the relief claimed.*

*He led a simple lifestyle and despite the success he saw in the profession, he always remained a humble person. This also earned him the nickname of 'Gandhi', between his friends. He was a champion of the rights of the underprivileged and was of the view that everybody deserved justice including the person who could not afford it.*

*Mr. Singh left for his heavenly abode on 5th May, 2021, due to COVID. He is survived by his wife Smt. Saroj Singh, Son - Sri Ashutosh Singh, who is an Advocate at the Allahabad High Court, Lucknow Bench, and is carrying forward his father's legacy and Daughter, Ms. Rashmi Singh, who is an Advocate-on-Record, practicing before the Supreme Court of India.*

## ***Shri Arun B. Saharya***

*(15th September, 1940 – 20th May, 2021)*

*Late Justice Arun B. Saharya was born on 15th September, 1940. His father Late Shri Sardar Bahadur Saharya was also a great and distinguished lawyer. He completed his schooling from Cambridge School, Delhi and went on to study at St. Stephens College excelling in extracurricular activities. Justice Saharya completed his LLB degree from the Delhi University and started his practice under senior advocate Prakash Narain who was later appointed as a Judge of the Delhi High Court. He was also appointed as the Standing Counsel for the Central Government. He appeared in the landmark case pertaining to the freedom of press in Hindustan Times Ltd. v. Union of India (1971). He was designated as a Senior Advocate by the Delhi High Court on 19.11.1984.*

*Shri Arun Saharya was a man who truly respected everyone irrespective of their age, status or social standing and he always made it a point to stand up and greet a person entering his chambers, even if the person was his junior. Besides being admired by his juniors, he was also popular amongst his colleagues and respected by the members of the Bar. Mr. Atul Sharma, one of his juniors is currently the Managing Partner at Link Legal India and he fondly remembers him as a person of propriety and righteousness.*

*A man fond of the smaller things in life, he always made it a point to take his entire team out for lunch after winning an important case. After successfully practicing for a number of years, Shri Arun Saharya was appointed as a Judge of the Delhi High Court on 24.04.1986. After a successful tenure at the Delhi High Court, he went on to be elevated as the Chief Justice of the Punjab & Haryana High Court. He had a keen eye for detail and would minutely assess each aspect of a case before rendering his decision. He is fondly remembered by those practicing before him as a man of great learning and polite demeanour.*

*He was a compassionate person and was one to always promote junior lawyers arguing before him. He always concentrated on the legal aspects of a case and did not let procedural defects come in the way of the litigant getting justice before him. Once he*

*permitted an impleadment being argued by a young lawyer only on his oral submissions and without any formal application and further himself offered that he would grant a stay also. Surprised, the young lawyer did not know how to react and laughingly, Justice Saharya granted the relief he thought was fit for the case.*

*Justice Saharya retired as the Chief Justice of the Punjab & Haryana High Court on 14.09.2002, after which he started doing arbitrations as well as practiced at the Supreme Court. Justice Saharya was also appointed as the Chairman of the Review Committee to prevent the misuse of the POTA Act in 2003 by the then Deputy Prime Minister, L.K. Advani. Justice Saharya was also fond of reading philosophy and enjoyed reading aspects of philosophy related to justice, humanity and goodness.*

*His wife Mrs. Prabha Saharya pre-deceased him in 2020 and after a year we lost Justice Saharya on 20th May 2021 due to Covid. He is survived by his brother Shri Vishnu Saharya Ji whom he was very close to and who is a senior member of our Bar and his nephew Viresh Saharya who is also an advocate in the Supreme Court.*

### ***Shri V.N. Ganpule***

*(28th July, 1936 – 11th August, 2021)*

*An excellent Advocate, Senior Advocate V.N. Ganpule was born on 28th July, 1936. He was undisputedly one of the most revered advocates of his times. Senior Advocate V.N. Ganpule was born in a family of lawyers, his father Late. Mr. Narayan M. Ganpule, was a practicing advocate at Barshi, in Solapur District of Maharashtra. Thus, law was part of his life and in his blood.*

*Mr. Ganpule completed his LL.B. from ILS College, Pune. Thereafter, he registered with the Bar Council of Maharashtra in the year 1961 and started practicing at Bombay High Court along with Late. Mr. K.J. Abhyankar. He shifted his practice to the Supreme Court in the year 1970 and became an Advocate-on-Record on 19th September, 1974. In 1985, he became one of the founding members of the Supreme Court Advocates-on-Record Association and was also elected as the Vice President in the first Executive Council.*

*He was a great friend and a good mentor for all his junior colleagues. He would go out of his way to help his juniors and propel them in their respective careers, and thus,*



*around 30 Advocates practiced with him as juniors. Many of whom he mentored went on to achieve great heights like Justice Madan Lokur who is retired of this Hon'ble Court as well as Justice A.M. Khanwilkar, Judge, Supreme Court of India. Justice Lokur even mentioned about the impact of the teachings of Mr. Ganpule in his retirement speech. From our younger members Advocates on-record Ms. Punam Kumari & Mr. Ashok Kumar Singh were his juniors.*

*He was designated as a Senior Advocate by the Supreme Court of India on 1st January, 1991. He was a great patron of legal aid work and believed that helping the needy should be the true calling of every lawyer. This propelled him to take large number of pro-bono cases despite his flourishing practice. He was also very keen to work for the welfare of the Bar and he would always contribute in some way or the other to help the bar.*

*Along with his advocacy, Mr. Ganpule was also known for his moral convictions. He considered social service as an important duty and was part of a social service group named “Lanjha-Sangamner Mitra Mandal Society” which adopts schools, hostels and orphanages in remote villages. He financially funded their logistical requirements and in the vacations, he even visited these villages to help with the social work personally.*

*He appeared in a large number of important cases. He appeared in the case of Vijaya Manohar Arbat v. Kashirao Rajaram Sawai [1987], wherein the Supreme Court held that a daughter, irrespective whether married or unmarried, having sufficient means, is liable to pay maintenance to her father or mother, who are unable to maintain themselves, under Section 125 of CrPC.*

*He also appeared in Rangaswami Textile Commr. v. Sagar Textile Mills [1977], wherein it was held that the word "may" is capable of meaning "must" or "shall" depending on the context it is used in.*

*Mr. Ganpule was a fine human being apart from being a legal luminary of his time and his loss has caused a severe jolt to the legal fraternity and a personal one to his friends and family and to those who have had the privilege of knowing him as a colleague at the bar. He is survived by two daughters Sangeeta Ganpule and Yogini D. Kulkarni, and a son Sameer Vasant Ganpule.*

## ***Shri S. K. Dholakia***

*(23rd May, 1938 – 26th August, 2021)*

*Shri S.K. Dholakia, or Shishirbhai as fondly called by his friends and colleagues was born in Gujarat on 23rd May 1938. Educated in a Gujarati medium school, he learned fluent English only when he went to St. Xaviers College in Mumbai. Within a short span he picked up the language with such grace that his friends called him English Gentleman because of his fluent English.*

*A simple, kind and brilliant lawyer, he started his career at Air India as an Administrative Officer for a few years before joining the legal profession. He was not only a great human being, but also a highly accomplished professional and had an experience of more than 50 years, specialising in Arbitration, Commercial and Tax Laws. He was a part of the Expert Committee constituted by the Law Commission of India towards preparation of the 246th Law Commission Report, which led to the 2015 Amendment to the Arbitration and Conciliation Act, 1996.*

*Shri S.K. Dholakia was a very gentle person however contrary to his personality, he was very fond of action movies and amongst them James Bond films being his favourite. He was also an avid reader and was very fond of mathematics and calculus and would often enjoy reading books from varied subjects. His passion for readings, led him to visit any library in places he was travelling to and he loved purchasing rare and important books.*

*Such was his stature in the legal field, that during his career he was offered judgeship twice. Once in 1983 for the Gujarat High Court and next in 1985 for the Delhi High Court. He declined both times. One of the major reasons was that he felt that the retirement age of 62 years was too early and he did not like the idea of practising after having been a judge.*

*In tax law, his knowledge was unparalleled at the time. Once seeing a lawyer struggling to explain a point of tax law before a Bench of Justice Kapadia, he intervened and succinctly explained the point involved to which Justice Kapadia exclaimed that since Shri Dholakia is here, we need not worry.*

*Apart from being a champion of tax law, Mr. Dholakia was a leading authority on Arbitration. He had great faith in it as a dispute resolution mechanism and dreamt of India becoming a hub of arbitration.*

*He also appeared in the landmark case of Bharat Aluminium Company v. Kaiser Aluminium Technical Service, [2012], popularly known as the BALCO case.*

*He also firmly believed that Arbitration is the most appropriate way in resolving Commercial Disputes, particularly international commercial disputes and that there is a lot to learn from the international scenario in this regard. He also advocated that though India is no doubt a part of the global economy, till our legal systems are not updated, our growth will be hampered. Though being a lawyer, his knowledge and interests spread to many important fields like economics, mathematics, history, philosophy and literature. A strict believer of time-management, he would put time limits for each task and would then put an alarm clock to ensure that the work is finished within the planned time limit.*

*He was also an education enthusiast. He headed the Gujarat Education Society (GES) at one point of time and had been on its governing body for a long time. The GES established Sardar Patel Vidyalaya (SPV) in 1958 which is now one of the best schools in Delhi. Both GES and SPV consulted him often for his expert legal guidance.*

*We lost Mr. Dholakia on 26th August, 2021. Mr. Dholakia's life and his professional journey will remain an example for everyone and he would be remembered as one of the calmest persons in the court. He is survived by two daughters Anupa Dholakia Gharpurey and Amita Chaudhury and a son, Mr. Ashish Dholakia, who is a Senior Advocate in Delhi.*

***Shri Padam Nath Nag (P.N. Nag)***

*(Born 5th March, 1933)*

*(Judge, Delhi High Court:– 12.10.1988 – 5.3.1995)*

*It is impossible to encompass in a few words the varied and distinguished career of an eminent jurist and lawyer like Shri P.N. Nag. He leaves behind him a legacy of the qualities required in a great jurist.*



*Padam Nath Nag was born on 5th March 1933 in Himachal Pradesh. After successfully completing his B.A. LL.B. he enrolled as an Advocate in 1965 and started his legal career at the District Courts at Dharamshala. Being a first-generation lawyer, he struggled as a young lawyer to find his feat in this profession.*

*In 1966 he moved to Shimla to practice at the High Court. His extreme hard work and dedication, got him great recognition and from 1981 he started practicing in the Supreme Court also. He was appointed Advocate General of Himachal Pradesh, on 5th May 1983. On 12th October, 1988 he was elevated as a Judge and transferred as a Judge of the Delhi High Court. He served at the Delhi High Court for seven years before retiring in 1995.*

*During his tenure at the Delhi High Court, he gave his contribution on various landmark judgments touching upon wide-ranging issues, including that of property law, Rent Control Act, arbitration, service matters, employee welfare, and many more which disclosed his brilliance in these fields of law.*

*Justice P.N Nag believed that justice is the true objective of the legal system and procedural lapses, though not desirable, should not come in its way. He always believed that another chance must be given to everyone and as such showed leniency wherever possible. His judgements also showed great compassion and a deep understanding of the society.*

*After his retirement, Justice P.N. Nag held many posts. He worked as Legal Advisor for Himachal Pradesh Mineral, Industrial & Development Corporation, Himachal Pradesh University and Food Corporation of India (H.P. Zone). Justice P.N. Nag also worked as Chairman, Other Backward Castes Commission from July, 1996 to December, 1996. He was a member of the Advisory Board of National Security Act and the Conservation of Foreign Exchange and Prevention of Smuggling Activities (COFEPOSA) Act.*

*He was also the President of the H.P. State Consumer Disputes Redressal Commission from 09.07.1996 to 05.03.2000.*

*Justice P.N. Nag had a good relationship with the legal fraternity. He had a great friendship with Justice R.S. Pathak, former Chief Justice of India and Shri G. Ramaswamy, former Attorney General for India.*

*He liked old Hindi songs, especially of Mohammad Rafi. He was a simple man and believed that with good conduct you can be closer to God. He also took interest in international politics and closely followed the political developments abroad.*

*The loss of Justice P.N. Nag is felt by both the Bar and the Bench and we all would remember him fondly as one of great legal minds of his time. He is survived by his three sons Mr. Anil Nag, who is an advocate practicing in the Supreme Court, Abhilash Nag, an advocate practicing in Dharamsala and Anuj Nag, an advocate practicing at the Shimla High Court.*

*While mourning the departed, we find some solace in the fact that these five great gentlemen lived an illustrious life and achieved great heights which will always remain an inspiration for the generations to come. I, on behalf of the Supreme Court Bar Association, offer my heartfelt condolences to the members of the families of Late Shri Vinod Kumar Singh, Late Shri Arun B. Saharya, Late Shri V.N. Ganpule, Late Shri S.K. Dholakia & Late Shri P.N. Nag. May their souls rest in divine peace.*

*We all have witnessed that the past year has been a very difficult one for our Bar during which we have lost a number of our distinguished members and many at a young age. While paying our tributes to the senior members of our Bar, on behalf of the Supreme Court Bar Association, I also offer my heartfelt condolences to the family members of all the 86 members of the Bar who we lost mainly due to Covid. May their souls rest in peace.*

xxxxx



*Reference made on 3rd March, 2022*

*by*

***Hon'ble The Chief Justice of India***

***Shri N. V. Ramana***

*in the memory of*

***Late Shri Vinod Kumar Singh,***

***Late Shri Arun B. Saharya,***

***Late Shri V. N. Ganpule,***

***Late Shri S. K. Dholakia and***

***Late Shri P. N. Nag,***

***Senior Advocates***

*We have assembled here this afternoon with a profound sense of grief to pay homage to Shri Vinod Kumar Singh, Shri Arun B. Saharya, Shri V.N. Ganpule, Shri S.K. Dholakia and Shri P.N. Nag, distinguished members of the legal fraternity who have made substantial contributions in the field of law.*

***Shri Vinod Kumar Singh***

*Shri Vinod Kumar Singh was born on 1st March, 1947. He first obtained a degree in science and then in law from Allahabad University. During his college days, he was hugely popular among the students and he used to always come forward to help fellow students. He was also elected as the Social Secretary of his hostel.*

*He enrolled in the U.P. Bar Council on 19th March 1975 and started his practice in District Court, Gonda. He has practiced in various courts throughout his tenure at the Bar and was appointed as the Public Prosecutor for a short while.*

*In the year 1982, he shifted to Lucknow with his family. There, he joined the Chambers of late Shri B.K. Singh, Advocate, who was later elevated as a Judge of the High Court of Allahabad.*

*Between the years 1995 and 2000, he served as the Standing Counsel for the State of*

*U.P. and represented the State before the High Court of Allahabad in various important matters. He also represented various corporations before the High Court of Allahabad as their panel lawyer.*

*In 2003, he represented the State of U.P. before the 'Liberhan Commission of Inquiry'.*

*He had the distinction of serving as the Additional Advocate General for the State of U.P. before the Lucknow Bench of the High Court of Allahabad, during the years 2004 to 2007. In recognition of his ability, dedication and sincerity as a lawyer, the High Court of Allahabad designated him as a Senior Advocate in the year 2006.*

*He also appeared before the Supreme Court of India in various civil and criminal matters. He appeared in Vishwesh Nath Vs The State of UP, wherein the role of democracy in a local body was highlighted. He was also a counsel in the case of Dr. Surendra Pandey Vs State of UP & Ors., wherein the Court clarified the nature of substantial justice and its primacy over technicalities.*

*Shri Singh was also deeply concerned about the welfare of advocates and espoused their causes. He served as the Vice-President of the Oudh Bar Association. He was also a Member of the Supreme Court Bar Association, a Lifetime Member of the Indian Law Institute, and the Bar Association of India.*

*He was a avid reader. Very early in his life he got inspired by the Gandhian philosophy of 'Truth', 'Boldness' and 'Struggle' after reading the books authored by him. He was known to be a man of character, who always upheld moral values and ethics, and he had a great belief in God.*

*He left for heavenly abode on 05th May, 2021 and is survived by his wife, Smt. Saroj Singh, son Shri Ashutosh Singh, who is an Advocate practicing in the High Court of Allahabad and presently representing the State of U.P. as the Standing Counsel; and daughter, Ms. Rashmi Singh, who is an Advocate-on-Record in the Supreme Court.*

### ***Shri Arun B. Saharya***

*Shri Arun B. Saharya was born into a family of distinguished educationists on 15th September, 1940. He completed his graduation from St. Stephen's College, University of Delhi.*

*Following in the footsteps of his late father Shri S.B. Saharya, he obtained his degree*

*in law from the University of Delhi. During his college days, he excelled in extracurricular activities and was the best cadet in the Republic Day parade.*

*He enrolled as an Advocate in the Mysore State Bar Council in October 1963 and later in the Delhi Bar Council in August 1965. Initially, he joined the chambers of Senior Advocate Prakash Narain, who later became Chief Justice of the Delhi High Court.*

*Upon starting his independent practice, he was appointed as Standing Counsel for the Union of India. He also appeared for other statutory bodies and represented private clients.*

*He appeared in many cases of importance, such as Indian Chemical and Pharmaceutical Works Vs. State of A.P., which pertained to the constitutionality of certain rules on the manufacture and export of chemicals.*

*His areas of practice included service law, administrative law, and property law.*

*In view of his vast experience and knowledge, he was designated as a Senior Advocate by the High Court of Delhi on 19th November, 1984. One can never forget the grace with which he conducted himself.*

*He was an outstanding Senior Advocate who earned a lot of respect at the Bar and stood out as a perfectionist. He shared a great bond with his juniors. He played the role of mentor effectively and took exceptional interest in their growth. He would urge them to think systematically.*

*He was appointed as a permanent Judge of the High Court of Delhi on 24th April, 1986. Thereafter he was appointed as Chief Justice of the High Court of Punjab and Haryana, where he was the third longest serving Chief Justice, having served in that office from 07th November 1997 to 14th September 2002.*

*He decided many cases during his tenure in both High Courts. In Wings Wear Corporation Vs. Workmen, he authored a vital judgement which demarcates the jurisdiction of the Tribunal with reference to the appropriate government under the Industrial Disputes Act.*

*In Gloria Chemicals Vs. R.K. Cables, he held that parties to civil suits should not be penalized for their counsel's mistake or inaction if their own actions are bona fide. He also decided several cases pertaining to service law, arbitration, rent control matters, and even unlawful detention.*

*Subsequent to his retirement, he was appointed as Chairman of the Central Review Committee to review all the cases brought under the Prevention of Terrorism Act.*

*He later resumed his practice as a Senior Advocate before the Supreme Court of India.*

*He was also actively involved in the Judicial Academy's trainings and lectures for judges in Delhi and Chandigarh.*

*He enjoyed reading books and keeping himself informed of the latest judicial pronouncements and developments in the legal field. He was a nature enthusiast and loved traveling with his family.*

*His wife, Smt. Prabha Saharya, pre-deceased him.*

*Unfortunately, for the last two years of his life, he was hospitalized due to heart and lung ailments. He left for his heavenly abode on 20th May, 2021 due to Covid-19 complications. He is survived by his brother, Shri Vishnu B. Saharya, nephews Shri Vivek B. Saharya and Shri Viresh B. Saharya, who are budding Advocates in Delhi, and their families.*

### ***Shri V.N. Ganpule***

*Shri V.N. Ganpule was born on 28th July, 1936. Following his father's footsteps, late Shri Narayan M. Ganpule, he too studied law. He obtained his degree in Law from ILS College, Pune.*

*He enrolled himself with the Bar Council of Maharashtra in August 1961. In the same year, he joined the Chambers of late Shri K. J. Abhyankar and started his practice in the High Court of Bombay.*

*After a decade, he shifted his independent practice to the Supreme Court of India in the year 1970 and thereafter became an Advocate-on-Record on 19th September, 1974.*

*He was one of the Founding Members of the Supreme Court Advocates-on-Record Association which came into existence in the year 1985 and was elected as its Vice-President.*

*Recognizing his knowledge, skill and standing at the Bar, the Supreme Court of India designated him as a Senior Advocate on 1st January, 1991. He marked his 50th year in the legal profession in the year 2011.*



*He has appeared and argued in the leading Constitutional law case of Waman Rao v Union of India, wherein the apex court explained the importance of Article 31A & 31B in light of the Basic Structure Doctrine.*

*He also appeared in Punjab Land Development & Reclamation Corporation v Presiding Officer, which is a landmark judgement in shaping and interpreting labour laws in India.*

*He was a mentor to around thirty Advocates who were practicing with him in the Supreme Court and helped them build their careers.*

*Many of his juniors have risen to great heights and became Judges of the High Courts as well as the Supreme Court such as Shri Justice Satish Agnihotri, Shri Justice Madan B. Lokur and Shri Justice A.M. Khanwilkar.*

*Despite his busy schedule, he was actively associated with the Supreme Court Legal Services Committee and had worked for its betterment and development throughout his legal career.*

*He was passionate about social service and philanthropy. He was associated with a social service group which adopted schools, hostels, and orphanages in remote villages and funded their requirements by providing books, clothes, stationery items, and the like. He also ensured that he visited all those institutes during the Court holidays.*

*He has also contributed towards building the first Cancer Hospital in his hometown of Barshi, Solapur in Maharashtra.*

*He shared a great bond with his siblings and had a closely knit circle of friends. Engaging himself in discussions and debates wasn't just a part of his job, but his life too.*

*He breathed his last on 11th August, 2021 and is survived by his son, Shri Sameer Vasant Ganpule, daughters Ms. Sangeeta Ganpule and Smt. Yogini D. Kulkarni and their families.*

### ***Shri S.K. Dholakia***

*Shri S.K. Dholakia was born on 23rd May, 1938. After completing his graduation from St. Xavier's College, Mumbai, he went on to study law and obtained his degree from the Law College in Pune.*

*Shri Dholakia described his entry into the legal profession as an accident. For a brief period, he worked as an Administrative Officer for Air India before realizing that*

his true calling was in the legal profession. He joined the legal profession in the year 1966.

In an interview, Shri Dholakia shared how his initial years of practice were hard. It was only after 7 years that he was able to get his first case regarding Central Excise.

He proved his legal acumen, especially in Commercial, Tax and Arbitration Laws. For about five decades, he practiced before the High Court of Delhi and the Supreme Court of India. Through sheer hard work, he became an accomplished Advocate. He was well known and respected for representing his clients with integrity, commitment, and diligence. Acknowledging his contribution, the High Court of Delhi designated him as a Senior Advocate in the year 1984.

He has appeared in major cases across various fields of law. He appeared in the landmark arbitration case of BALCO. He has also appeared in leading constitutional cases, such as Unni Krishnan JP v. State of AP, which was critical to the fundamental right to education, and in the case of ADM Jabalpur v. Shivakant Shukla.

He also appeared in Special Reference No.1 of 2001, a landmark case on the doctrine of harmonious construction of the three lists in the Seventh Schedule of the Constitution.

He appeared in the case of 'Madhav Rao Scindia Vs. Union of India, where it was held that the presidential order derecognizing the privileges of the ex-rulers of Indian states was declared unconstitutional.

He also appeared in the case 'P. A. Inamdar Vs. State of Maharashtra' wherein it had been held that the professional and unaided educational institutions were obligated to maintain requisite standards of professional excellence through a fair and transparent admission process.

He was offered the post of a judge twice. He received offers from the High Court of Gujarat and the High Court of Delhi and declined both. Shri Dholakia's contribution to the field of Arbitration in India has been immense. He has represented India in various capacities. He was a member of the ICC International Court of Arbitration in Paris and the Board of London Court of International Arbitration, to list a few. Further he represented India in the Arbitration Committee of the International Law Association, London.

*Due to his experience and knowledge, he was part of the expert committee constituted by the Law Commission of India, whose recommendations culminated in the 2015 amendment to the Arbitration and Conciliation Act, 1996. He was also part of the Committee for approving amendments to existing Indian bilateral investment treaties.*

*During the 1980s and 1990s, he was a regular contributor to The Economic Times and wrote a book titled 'The Rights of Minority Shareholders'. Several of his writings on the Law of the Sea, taxation and arbitration were published in national and international journals.*

*He was devoted to a life of learning. Besides his love of law, he was passionate about reading books on history, philosophy, literature and mathematics. He was inquisitive and often would work on problem sets in trigonometry or calculus to sharpen his mind. If not in Court or his chamber, he would frequently be found in the Supreme Court Library. He loved visiting libraries and bookstores.*

*He was a mentor to budding advocates and a teacher to those who were preparing for the Advocate-on-Record Examination. He even authored a Book titled 'Guide to Accounts for Advocate-on-Record Examination'.*

*He deeply believed in improving our education system. He was the Chairman of the Gujarat Education Society, the governing body of Sardar Patel Vidyalaya, a position he held for several years.*

*He lived a life of integrity, humility, hard work and service. He was a kind and compassionate human being.*

*His wife, Smt. Yamini Dholakia pre-deceased him, who was a lover of arts, a singer, and a newsreader on the All India Radio. Both of them frequented musical concerts, plays, and art galleries.*

*Shri Dholakia breathed his last on 26th August, 2021 and is survived by his son Shri Ashish Dholakia, who is a Senior Advocate practicing in Delhi, daughters, Smt. Anupa Dholakia and Smt. Amita Chaudhury and their families.*

### ***Shri P. N. Nag***

*Shri P. N. Nag was born on 05th March, 1933 in a family with a humble background. He completed his graduation from Government Degree College, Dharamshala. He was determined to get education against all odds and used to walk 22 kilometers from his*



*village to the college to save on bus fare. He actively participated in student politics and was elected the President of the Dharamshala College Students Association.*

*He started his legal practice in the year 1965 by enrolling as an Advocate. Initially he practiced in the District Court, Dharamshala for a year and thereafter shifted his practice to the High Court of Himachal Pradesh in 1966.*

*Between the year 1966 and 1971, he practiced before the High Court of Delhi. He also practiced before the Supreme Court of India from the year 1981. He appeared in many cases of importance such as Pradeep Jain Vs. Union of India, which ruled on important issues surrounding reservation of seats in post graduate colleges.*

*He also appeared in Deva Ram Vs. Ishwar Chand which interpreted Order II rule 2 of the CPC relating to claims and what constitutes relinquishment of claims.*

*He was also appointed as the Legal Advisor to the Himachal Pradesh University, Himachal Pradesh Agricultural University, and Mineral and Industrial Development Corporation of Himachal Pradesh.*

*His popularity at the Bar was tremendous, so much so that he was elected as the Vice-President of the Himachal Pradesh High Court Bar Association. He established himself as a leading Advocate in the field of Constitutional Law and Election Law. In the year 1982-83, the High Court of Himachal Pradesh set aside the election of two Members of the Legislative Assembly and in both the cases, Shri Nag was the Counsel for the Election Petitioner.*

*On 05th May, 1983 he was appointed as the Advocate General for the State of Himachal Pradesh, a position which he held for more than five years.*

*He was appointed as a permanent Judge of the High Court of Delhi on 12th October, 1988 and transferred to the High Court of Allahabad on 28th April, 1994.*

*During his tenure as Judge, he decided many cases on varied issues of social significance.*

*He retired on 04th March, 1995. Subsequent to his retirement, he was appointed as the President of the Himachal Pradesh State Consumer Disputes Redressal Commission on 9th July, 1996 and remained in that office till 05th March, 2000. He also held the additional charge of Backward Classes Commission for Himachal Pradesh.*



*He was also a Member of the Advisory Board under Conservation of Foreign Exchange and Prevention of Smuggling Activities Act and Advisory Board under the National Security Act.*

*His finest quality was his innate humility. He was benevolent and straightforward. Those who knew him well would always remember him as such.*

*He took active interest in charity and even established a Trust in the name of his father to help the distressed. He loved listening to old classics sung by Talat Mehmood and Mohammad Rafi. He would keenly follow international politics.*

*He left for heavenly abode on 11th September, 2021 and is survived by his sons, Shri Anil Nag, who is an Advocate practicing in the Supreme Court, Shri Abhilash Nag, who is an Advocate practicing at Dharamshala, Shri Anuj Nag, who is an Advocate practicing in the High Court of Himachal Pradesh and their families.*

*My Brother and Sister Judges join me in conveying our heartfelt condolences to the bereaved families of Shri Vinod Kumar Singh, Shri Arun B. Saharya, Shri V.N. Ganpule, Shri S.K. Dholakia and Shri P.N. Nag. We pray to the Almighty to give them strength to bear this irreparable loss with fortitude.*

*May the departed souls rest in peace.*

xxxxx

## *List of Attendees at the Full Court Reference*

- ❖ *Shri K.K. Venugopal,  
Ld. Attorney General for India.*
- ❖ *Shri Tushar Mehta,  
Solicitor General of India.*
- ❖ *Shri Vikas Singh, (Sr.)  
President,  
Supreme Court Bar Association.*
- ❖ *Shri Pradeep Kumar Rai, (Sr.)  
Vice President,  
Supreme Court Bar Association.*
- ❖ *Shri Ardhendumauli Kumar Prasad,  
Hony. Secretary,  
Supreme Court Bar Association.*
- ❖ *Shri Shivaji M. Jadhav,  
President,  
Supreme Court Advocates-on-Record Association.*
- ❖ *Shri Manoj K. Mishra,  
Vice President,  
Supreme Court Advocates-on-Record Association.*
- ❖ *Shri Joseph Aristotle S.,  
Hony. Secretary,  
Supreme Court Advocates-on-Record Association.*

xxxxx

*Family Members of  
Late Shri P. N. Nag  
Senior Advocate  
at the Full Court Reference*

- ❖ *Mr. Anil Nag, Son*
- ❖ *Mrs. Shyama Nag, Daughter-in-law*
- ❖ *Mr. Anmol Nag, Grandson*
- ❖ *Mr. Aditya Nag, Grandson*
- ❖ *Mr. Anuj Nag, Son*
- ❖ *Mr. Abhilash Nag, Son*

xxxxx



**THE SUPREME COURT OF INDIA**

New Delhi - 110001

India